

Jwāngdǔ 4 人間世

A Taeko Brooks 白妙子

University of Massachusetts at Amherst

WSWG Note 108 (8 Sept 1996)

Abstract. One feature of the Jwāngdǔ (JZ) is verbal similarities between chapters. Two ways of reading these similarities have been proposed: (1) our JZ is the disordered state of a text in which each set of such passages *was originally located together* (Graham **How Much**, 1979, plus the reconstruction in Graham **Inner**, 1981), or (2) it shows contact among separate Dàuist groups, each of which is represented by a chapter in our JZ (Brooks **Present** 58). Pursuing the first alternative, Graham **Inner** rearranges Jwāngdǔ segments which are *literarily integral*, and correspond to paragraphs in Watson. But Graham's own reconstruction of the Mician logic treatises suggests that physical corruption leads to broken sentences, not relocated paragraphs. And if editorial manipulation and not random disarrangement is the cause of our present JZ, why should the editorial manipulation have led to a *less well ordered* text? I thus regard Graham **Inner** as a suggestive literary exercise, but not as a convincing restoration. I here argue for the second alternative, by showing that JZ 4 has its own compositional history, and was not composed at one time, or with a constant purpose.

The Accretional Alternative. I do not assume an original integral text, by Jwāng Jōu or anyone else. I assume that each of JZ chapter came into being on its own terms. The goal of an analysis along these lines is not, with Graham, to homogenize the text, but to account plausibly for its differences, allowing for its growth, if any, and noting its relations with other texts.

JZ 4 (2,800 words) is one of the longer Inner chapters (the average is 1,975). Like other Inner chapters, it has no obvious relations with the Dàu/Dv Jīng . The material, with size in characters and category (A anecdote, F fable in which inarticulate beings speak, D descriptive statements, S summary comment), is as follows:

- | | | | |
|-----|------|---|-------------------------------------------------------------|
| 4:1 | 1034 | A | Confucius advises Yén Hwéi on visit to a ruler |
| 4:2 | 612 | A | Confucius advises Dž-gāu on visit to a ruler |
| 4:3 | 320 | A | Chy'w Bwó-y'w advises Yén H'v on a tutorship |
| 4:4 | 348 | F | Carpenter Sh'f and the useless tree in Chí |
| 4:5 | 117 | A | Nánbwó Dž-ch'f and the useless tree in S'ng |
| 4:6 | 121 | S | Comment on useful trees in S'ng |
| 4:7 | 106 | D | Crippled Sh'f can live out his allotted span of life |
| 4:8 | 105 | A | Madman Jy'f Y'w criticizes Confucius |
| 4:9 | 37 | S | Mountain trees harm themselves by being useful |

There are two zones in the chapter, and those two zones take opposite sides of the same issue: (1) 4:1-3, on how to handle a dangerous official assignment, presume a pro-service position, whereas (2) 4:4-8 avoid dangers (4:4-6, 8) or denounce those in office (4:7). The chapter thus appears to have changed its mind on the issue of service.

But in which direction? We note that JZ 4:7 is virtually identical to LY 18:5, with the difference that in LY 18:5 Confucius attempts to speak to Jyē Yw, who flees. This represents Jyē Yw as tacitly unwilling to defend his views, and his departure leaves Confucius rhetorically victorious. May not LY 18:5 be *replying* to JZ 4:7, and accusing it of moral cowardice? The pro-service stance of JZ 4:1-3 might then be a response to this accusation from the Analects: accepting the obligation of service, but prescribing some remedy for its dangers.

Evolving a Theory. If so, then the head of the chapter (JZ 4:1-3) is later than its tail (JZ 4:4-8), and the chapter position changes from refusal to acceptance of service. Let us see if a self-consistent theory can be based on this possibility.

JZ 4:1-3. (1) These passages double in size from 4:3 to 4:2, and again from 4:2 to 4:1. Size cannot be assumed to be an assured index of relative date, but it is still the more likely assumption that the order of composition is 4:3 > 4:2 > 4:1. (2) Read in this order, the pieces show increasing confidence: 4:3 advises energetic wariness, as though in a tiger's cage; 4:2 warns that pressing a good situation will turn it into a bad one; and 4:1 offers a mystical recipe for moving freely in a dangerous situation. (3) Note also an increasing Confucianization in the shift from Chyw Bwó-yw (4:3) to Confucius (4:2-1) as the master, and in the climactic appearance of the Confucian Yén Hwéi (4:1) as the disciple. All these content indications are consistent with the idea that the compositional order was 4:3 > 2 > 1.

JZ 4:4-7. Putting aside the enigmatic 4:8, which may or may not be a final bit of the Madman's speech in 4:7, and also 4:4b and 4:5b as sequels, and thus as possibly later added to 4:4a and 4:5a, we find that 4a, 5a, 6, and 7 are about the same size, giving no initial clue as to compositional order. However: (1) within the metaphorical 4a, 5a, and 6, the progression is from nonhuman protagonists (useless trees in 4a and 5a) to human ones (Crippled Shú in 6); (2) between that group and 4:7, the transition is from *human* to *historical* figures, specifically Confucius; also (3), 4:7 seems to be the challenge which, after it was successfully rebutted by the Analects, led to the change of heart in JZ 4 itself, so that 4:7 ought to be the culmination of this series. We thus reach, as our first hypothesis, the presumed compositional order 4a > 5a > 6 > 7 (followed by 3 > 2 > 1).

Does the content of these sections support this conclusion? Not entirely. I would say that the 4a useless tree story is literarily more sophisticated than 5a, and thus probably later: (1) the tree is more elaborately described in 4a; (2) 4a, a dialogue, is more complex than the 5a monologue; and (3) the 5a protagonist discovers the uselessness of the tree, but in 4a the master instantly perceives it, leaving his disciple to elicit by his questions the moral for the reader. I conclude that 4a is a narrative refurbishing of the more solitary 5a. I note in addition that 4b could have been added to the series, at some point or other, as a third useless tree story, developing further along the ways in which 4a advances over 5a.

The hope to "live out one's allotted years" 終其天年 is common to 4b, 5b, and 6, suggesting that these may be adjacent in time, and the mention of "men with piles" as unsuitable for sacrifice in 5b makes that passage a plausible bridge from the nonhuman 4a and 5a to the human 6.

But some details in 4:4b point in to a later placement: (1) Graham vocabulary links exist between 4b and the 4:1-3 group; (2) the carpenter ends 4b by saying that the tree “protects itself in a different way from ordinary people,” thus legitimizing the idea of a different sort of caution; and (3) the tree’s argument against argument (“What’s the point of this – things condemning things?”) may be read as a wish to diminish the dispute between the survivalist 4a position and the Confucian service ethic, with which 4:3 begins to negotiate terms of engagement. 4b then does seem to update 4a, and in a way that tends to harmonize the two halves of the document.¹

Conclusion. I infer the following order of composition for the material of JZ 4:

- 4:5a one-person anecdote of a passerby and a “useless” tree
- 4:4a two-person anecdote of a carpenter and a “useless” tree
- 4:5b statement explaining 5a in more neutral terms; 終其天年
- 4:6 more developed and exaggerated human metaphor; 終其天年
- 4:7 fully human confrontation with Confucius on the service issue
- 4:8 mountain trees harm themselves by being useful

[LY 18:5-7 denounces this cowardice and issues a call to political duty]

- 4:3 wary acceptance of the duty of service; Chy’w Bw’o-y’w as master
- 4:4b reconciles 4:4a 終其天年 and 4:3 (“a different way”); reduces tension
- 4:2 longer, more confident; Confucius as master
- 4:1 longest, most confident; Confucius as master, Yén Hwéi as disciple

Taken as a whole, then, JZ 4 records the Dàuist half of one Dàuist encounter with late Analects Confucianism on the issue of service versus withdrawal; the Confucian half of the encounter is found in LY 18:5-7. Confucius was victorious in that encounter, and the later sections of JZ 4 use him to articulate the chapter’s new stance. It has been noted that Confucius appears more often in the Jwāngdǔ than does Jwāng Jōu, and that in many of his appearances Confucius is a source of wisdom, not an object of ridicule. JZ 4 may then give us a close look at one moment in that process of Confucianizing, showing more clearly what were the original issues on both sides of the confrontation.

Works Cited

- E Bruce Brooks. The Present State. . . of Pre-Hàn Text Studies. SPP #46 (1994) 1-74
 A C Graham. Chuang Tzu: The Inner Chapters. Allen & Unwin 1981
 A C Graham. How Much of Chuangtzu Did Chuangtzu Write? JAAR v37 #3 (1979)
 459-501; in Studies in Chinese Philosophy, 1986; SUNY 1990, 283-321
 A C Graham. Later Mohist Logic, Ethics and Science. Chinese University Press 1978
 Burton Watson. The Complete Works of Chuang Tzu. Columbia 1968

¹For this suggestion about 4b, I am indebted in part to the analysis of Ding Xiang Warner, presented in a paper discussed at the 7th WSWG Conference (Amherst, 5 Oct 1996).