

The Shū 書

E Bruce Brooks 白牧之

University of Massachusetts at Amherst

23 March 2009

Introduction. Many Shū 書 “Documents,” also called Shàng Shū 尚書 “Ancient Documents,” purporting to be speeches or narratives from antiquity, were quoted in, and probably written for, the Confucian/Mician controversies of the Warring States.¹ Of Shū inventories in Hàn there are three: (1) the Fú Shǎng 28 plus a Tàì Shǐ 太誓, supposedly found in Hàn, making 29; (2) these plus another 29, supposedly discovered in a wall when Confucius’ house in Lǚ was torn down in c0154, for a total of 58; and (3) these plus another 42, for a suspiciously neat total of 100, listed in a Preface (the Syǎu Syǔ 小序, Legge 1-14). This was probably written by Kǔng Ān-guó 孔安國, who is said to have deciphered the Wall texts and presented them to the Hàn court. The 100 Shū of the Preface are given as an Appendix, below.

Fú Shǎng 伏勝, a Chín erudite and thus one with access to otherwise proscribed Confucian texts,² seems to have been the only one who possessed Shū when the 0213 Chín ban on Confucian texts was lifted in 0191; his were written in the Chín reformed or “new” script, jīn-wén 今文. They were later augmented by the supposed discovery of the Tàì Shǐ 太誓. As the sole possessor of Shū, Fú Shǎng was summoned to the Hàn court under Wén-dì ① 0179-0157), but was then too old to go; Cháu Tswò 朝錯 was sent to study with him. Later Shū lineages are the Cháu Tswò, Oūyáng 歐陽 and Syàhóu 夏侯 lines. The latter two are represented in the Hàn Palace Library catalogue; their inventory is the Fú Shǎng 28 Shū plus the Tàì Shǐ. These 29 approved Shū (in the Oūyáng version) were engraved on stone in 175-183, at the end of Latter Hàn.

The Wall Shū. This parallel set of 29 Shū was written in the pre-Chín or “old” script, gǔ-wén 古文, probably by their purported discoverer, Kǔng Ān-guó. They made little impact on Hàn mainstream scholarship, but they and the associated Preface, which may have been written later, were accepted by Szmǎ Tán:³ titles from the Preface are cited at appropriate places in the Shǐ Jì, and two texts on that list are quoted in SJ 3 (殷本紀) along with one from the Fú Shǎng or jīn-wén inventory.⁴ Other Wall texts were quoted in some treatises in the Lǐ Jì compendium (mostly of Former Hàn date), the Hàn Shū (c0100), and by Jǐng Sywǎn (127-200). The Wall texts did not receive official recognition, and eventually passed out of existence.

¹Among those are Mician tracts against music in MZ 32, and against fate in MZ 36 and 37, and a Confucian legend of filial and fraternal Shùn, which gets a long discussion in MC 5A2.

²See the Lǐ Sǐ memorial in SJ 85; Brooks **Szmǎ Tán** 226.

³Whose philological credulity is shown by his treating the Jàn-guó Tsǔ as a primary source.

⁴The sequence of excerpts at one point in SJ 3 is Tāng Jǐng 湯征 (a Wall text), Tāng Shǐ 湯誓 (from Fú Shǎng), and Tāng Gào 湯誥 (another Wall text); see Nienhauser 1.42-45.

The gǔ-wén Shū were presented to the Jīn court in 317 by Méi Dǎ Méi 梅賾. Later, Yáo Jì-hǔng 姚祭恆 (1647-1715), Yén Rǔ-wò-jǔw 閻若璩 (1636-1704), and others showed that they were forged.⁵ Critical scholars now accept Fú Shǔng's 28 Shū, ignoring the Tàì Shǔ.⁶ That inventory is given below, numbered by title in the first column and in standard form in the second; Fú Shǔng's Shū are numbered in **bold**:

TANG 唐 [Legge I]		JOU 周 [Legge V]	
01	01 堯典 Yáo Dyǎn	21A	27 泰誓上 Tàì Shǔ A
	YW 虞 [Legge II]	21A	28 泰誓中 Tàì Shǔ B
02	02 舜典 Shùn Dyǎn ⁷	21C	29 泰誓下 Tàì Shǔ C
03	03 大禹莫 Dà Yǔ Mwò	22	30 牧誓 Mù Shǔ
04	04 皋陶謨 Gāu-yáo Mwò	23	31 武成 Wǔ Chǐng
05	05 益稷 Yì / Jì ⁸	24	32 洪範 Hóng Fàn
	SYA 夏 [Legge III]	25	33 旅獒 Lǚ Áu
06	06 禹貢 Yǔ Gòng	26	34 金縢 Jīn Téng
07	07 甘誓 Gān Shǔ	27	35 大誥 Dà Gào
08	08 五子之歌 Wǔ Dǐ jǐ Gǔ	28	36 微子之命 Wēi-dǐ jǐ Mìng
09	09 胤征 Yìn Jǐng	29	37 康誥 Kāng Gào
	SHANG 商 [Legge IV]	30	38 酒誥 Jiǔ Gào
10	10 湯誓 Tāng Shǔ	31	39 梓材 Zǐ Cái
11	11 仲虺之誥 Jùngh-wěi jǐ Gào	32	40 召誥 Zhào Gào
12	12 湯誥 Tāng Gào	33	41 洛誥 Luò Gào
13	13 伊訓 Yī Syǔn	34	42 多士 Duō Shǔ
14A	14 太甲上 Tàì Jyǎ A	35	43 無逸 Wú Yì
14B	15 太甲中 Tàì Jyǎ B	36	44 君奭 Jyǔn Shǔ
14C	16 太甲下 Tàì Jyǎ C	37	45 蔡仲之命 Tsài Jùngh jǐ Mìng
15	17 咸有一德 Syén Yǒu Yī Dǎ	38	46 多方 Duō Fāng
16A	18 盤庚上 Pán Gǐng A	39	47 立政 Lì Jǐng
16B	19 盤庚中 Pán Gǐng B	40	48 周官 Jōu Gwān
16C	20 盤庚下 Pán Gǐng C ⁹	41	49 君陳 Jyǔn Chǐn
17A	21 說命上 Ywè Mìng A	42	50 顧命 Gù Mìng
17B	22 說命中 Ywè Mìng B	43	51 康王之誥 Kāng-wáng jǐ Gào
17C	23 說命下 Ywè Mìng C	44	52 畢命 Bì Mìng
18	24 高宗彤日 Gāu-dzūng Róng-rì	45	53 君牙 Jyǔn Yá
19	25 西伯戡黎 Syī-bwó Kān Lí	46	54 罔命 Wǎng Mìng
20	26 微子 Wēi-dǐ	47	55 呂刑 Lǚ Syíng
			[POST-JOU]
		48	56 文侯之命 Wǎn-hóu jǐ Mìng
		49	57 費誓 Fèi Shǔ
		50	58 秦誓 Qín Shǔ

⁵See Elman **Philology** 215f; this is one of the great achievements of Chinese scholarship.

⁶The Hàn Tàì Shǔ has several times been reconstituted from Hàn quotes. Legge appends one reconstruction; its narrative portions overlap with the Wǔ Chǐng, Shū 31, of the present canon.

⁷Conventionally combined with the preceding as the Yáo Dyǎn.

⁸Conventionally combined with the preceding as the Gāu-yáo Mwò.

⁹Conventionally counted as a single text; there are thus 9 Fú Shǔng Shū in this first column (2 early, 2 Syà, and 5 Shāng). These plus the 19 in the second column give the Fú Shǔng 28.

Text. The Táng Stone Classics (833-837) include both jīn-wǎn and gǔ-wǎn Shū, and are the oldest complete text. Rǔwǎn Yǔwén's Thirteen Classics edition of 1816 is the modern standard, and underlies Legge's bilingual edition. Early quotations from lost Shū are given in Chyǔ Wàn-lǐ's commentary and in the HK concordance.

Credibility. Of the canonical texts, Shū 1-23 claim to derive from a time before writing existed in China. Shū attributed to Jōu differ from the language of Jōu bronze inscriptions, and *in different ways*; they are thus also suspect.¹⁰ In general, the Jōu Shū cluster around the dynastic transitions which interested 04th century theorists, and expound 04c political theories (exemplary virtue 明德) and institutions (an advanced legal system) for which there is no Jōu evidence. The extra titles in the Wall group offer further documentation for high antiquity, a matter of exceptional interest in Hàn, with its concern for origins. The claim of their discovery is intrinsically dubious.¹¹

Warring States writers sometimes betray the dubious nature of the Shū texts then in circulation. The Mician jibe in MZ 48:4 (子之古非古也 “Your antiquity is not really ancient,” c0280) suggests an intentional effort to trump the Jōu-centered Confucians by going back to the more ancient Syà and Shāng. Note also the Mencian rejection of the Wǔ Chǎng (our Shū 31 is a cleaned-up version of it) in MC 7B3 (c0252).

As for the best attested of the extant texts, Fú Shǎng's 28 Shū, not only are they not quoted until the 04c, but it can be shown that several were extended by additions in the late 04c or 03c.¹² Their formation process lay wholly within the Warring States. The early quotes are evidence for Warring States theory debates, but may remind us that the missiles flung in those debates tended to be of recent manufacture.

Works Cited

- A Taeko Brooks. The Jyǒu Gàu 酒誥. WSP v2 (2018) 86-88
 E Bruce Brooks. Fěi 匪 and Certain Related Words. WSP v2 (2018) 15-18
 E Bruce Brooks. Shǐ 195 and Shū 32. WSP v1 (2010) 43-45
 Chyǔ Wàn-lǐ 屈萬里. 尚書釋義. [臺灣] 中華 1956
 Herrlee G Creel. The Origins of Statecraft in China. v1 Chicago 1970
 Benjamin A Elman. From Philosophy to Philology. 1984; rev UCLA 2001
 Hú Dìng-shǎng 何定生. 尚書的文法及其年代. 國立中山大學語言歷史研究所週刊 5ser #49-51 (1928) 1781-1981
 Bernhard Karlgren. The Book of Documents. BMFEA v22 (1950) 1-81
 James Legge. The Shoo King [Chinese Classics v3]. 1865
 Mǎ Hǎng 馬衡. 漢石經集存. 科學 1957
 William H Nienhauser (ed). The Grand Scribe's Records. v1 Indiana 1994

¹⁰See Hú Dìng-shǎng. Critical scholarship has been unwilling to do without the Jōu Shū; Creel (**Origins** 449-454) considers these twelve reliable: Shū 35, 37-42, 44, 46, 50, 56-57.

¹¹The recovery of the Analects from the wall of the Confucian headquarters in 0159 spawned other “wall find” claims. The SJ 121 claim that Fú Shǎng hid his Shū in the wall of his house, and on retrieving them found only 28 still readable, looks like a myth intended to represent his inventory as originally larger, thus harmonizing it with the later gǔ-wǎn “find.”

¹²See Brooks **Shǐ 195**, Brooks **Fěi**, and Brooks **Jyǒu Gàu**.

Appendix: The 100 Shū of the Hàn Preface

The canonical numbering, with 今文 text numbers in **bold**, is given in the first column

		EARLY		18	51	Pán-gvng A	
01	01	Yáu Dyěn		19	52	Pán-gvng B	
02	02	Shùn Dyěn		20	53	Pán-gvng C	
	03	Gù Dzwò	汨作		21	54	Ywè Míng A
	04	Jyōu Gūng A	九共甲		22	55	Ywè Míng B
	05	Jyōu Gūng B	九共乙		23	56	Ywè Míng C
	06	Jyōu Gūng C	九共丙	24	57	Gāu-dzūng Rùng R	
	07	Jyōu Gūng D	九共丁		58	Gāu-dzūng jī Sywñ	高宗之訓
	08	Jyōu Gūng E	九共戊	25	59	Syī-bwó Kān Lí	
	09	Jyōu Gūng F	九共己	26	60	Wēi-dz	
	10	Jyōu Gūng G	九共庚			JOU 周	
	11	Jyōu Gūng H	九共辛	27	61	Tài Shr A	
	12	Jyōu Gūng I	九共壬	28	62	Tài Shr B	
	13	Gāu Yw	糝飶	29	63	Tài Shr C	
03	14	Dà Yw Mwò		30	64	Mù Shr	
04	15	Gāu-yáu Mwò		31	65	Wǔ Chvng	
05	16	Yì / Jì		32	66	Húng Fàn	
		SYA 夏			67	Fvñ Chì	分器
06	17	Yw Gùng		33	68	Lǚ Áu	
07	18	Gān Shr			69	Cháu Míng	巢命
08	19	Wǔ Dž jī Gv		34	70	Jīn Tvng	
09	20	Yīn Jvng		35	71	Dà Gàu	
	21	Dì Gàu	帝告[誥]	36	72	Wēi-dž jī Míng	
	22	Lí Wò	蠶沃		73	Gwēi Hí	歸禾
	23	Tāng Jvng	湯征		74	Jyā Hí	嘉禾
	24	Rǔ Jyōu	汝鳩	37	75	Kāng Gàu	
	25	Rǔ Fāng	汝方	38	76	Jyōu Gàu	
		SHANG 商		39	77	Dž Tsáu	
10	26	Tāng Shr		40	78	Shàu Gàu	
	27	Syà Shv	夏社	41	79	Lwò Gàu	
	28	Yí Jì	疑至	42	80	Dwō Shr	
	29	Chvñ Hù	臣扈	43	81	Wú Yì	
	30	Dyěn Bǎu	典寶	44	82	Jywn Shr	
11	31	Jùng-hwěi jī Gàu		45	83	Tsài Jùng jī Míng	
12	32	Tāng Gàu			84	Chvng-wāng Jvng	成王政
	33	Míng-jyw	明居		85	Jyāng Pú-gū	將蒲姑
13	34	Yì Sywñ		46	86	Dwō Fāng	
	35	Sž Míng	肆命	47	87	Lì Jvng	
	36	Dzǔ Hòu	徂后	48	88	Jōu Gwān	
14	37	Tài-jyǎ A			89	Sù-shvñ jī Míng	肅慎之命
15	38	Tài-jyǎ B			90	Bwò-gū	亳姑
16	39	Tài-jyǎ C		49	91	Jywn Chvñ	
17	40	Syén Yōu Yī Dv		50	92	Gù Míng	
	41	Wò-dīng	沃丁	51	93	Kāng-wāng jī Gàu	
	42	Syén Yì A	咸义甲	52	94	Bì Míng	
	43	Syén Yì B	咸义乙	53	95	Jywn Yá	
	44	Syén Yì C	咸义丙	54	96	Jyung Míng	
	45	Syén Yì D	咸义丁	55	97	Lǚ Syíng	
	46	Yī Jì	伊陟			POST-JOU	
	47	Ywán Míng	原命	56	98	Wvñ-hóu jī Míng	
	48	Jùng-dīng	仲丁	57	99	Bì Shr	
	49	Hí-dān-jyǎ	河亶甲	58	100	Chín Shr	
	50	Dzǔ Yǐ	祖乙				